

1
2
3
4
5 THE STATE OF TEXAS) IN THE DISTRICT COURT
6
7 vs.) ANDREWS COUNTY, TEXAS
8
9
10 ANNE MARIE MITCHELL) 109TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
11
12
13
14 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
15
16
17
18 On the 11th day of February, 2010, the
19 following proceedings came on to be heard in the
20 above-entitled and numbered cause before the Honorable
21 James L. Rex, Judge Presiding, held in Andrews, Andrews
22 County, Texas:
23 Proceedings reported by computerized
24 stenotype machine.
25

1	Defendant Rests -----	8
2	Evidence Closed -----	9
3	Defendant's Objections to the Court's Charge -----	10
4	Court's Ruling -----	14
5	Court's Charge -----	15
6	Closing Argument by Counsel for the State -----	15
7	Closing Argument by Counsel for the Defendant -----	16
8	Closing Argument by Counsel for the State -----	26
9	Verdict -----	36
10	Court Adjourned -----	38
11	Reporter's Certificate -----	39

ALPHABETICAL WITNESS INDEX

	Voir			
17	WITNESSES	Direct	Cross	Dire Volume
18	Sean Kevin Roden, M.D.	4	7	4

EXHIBIT INDEX

23	DEFENDANT'S	PAGE	PAGE	
24	EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	OFFERED	RECD. VOL.
25	8	Proposed Charge of the Court	13	13 4

APPEARANCES:

FOR THE STATE:

MR. SCOTT TIDWELL
Winkler County Attorney
SBOT NO. 20020730
P.O. Box 1040
Kermit, Texas 79745
Phone: (432) 586-6036

FOR THE DEFENDANT:

MR. JOHN H. COOK
Cook & Cantacuzene
SBOT NO. 04735700
203 W. Wall Street, Suite 603
Midland, Texas 79701
Phone: (432) 640-0464

MR. BRIAN CARNEY
Attorney at Law
SBOT NO. 03832275
1202 W. Texas Avenue
Midland, Texas 79701
Phone: (432) 686-8300

CHRONOLOGICAL INDEX VOLUME 4 - PROCEEDINGS OF FEBRUARY 10, 2010

23	Voir			
24	DEFENDANT'S WITNESSES	Direct	Cross	Dire Volume
25	Sean Kevin Roden, M.D.	4	7	4

1 February 10, 2010
2 9:03 a.m.
3 (JURY PRESENT)
4 THE COURT: Welcome back, ladies and
5 gentlemen.
6 Call your next witness, Mr. Cook.
7 MR. CARNEY: Your Honor, we'd call
8 Dr. Roden.
9 THE COURT: You haven't been sworn?
10 THE WITNESS: No, I have not.
11 (WITNESS SWORN)
12 THE COURT: Have a seat right here.
13
14 SEAN KEVIN RODEN, M.D.,
15 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:
16 DIRECT EXAMINATION
17 BY MR. CARNEY:
18 Q. Good morning.
19 A. Morning.
20 Q. Would you tell the jury what your name is
21 please.
22 A. Yes. My name is Sean Kevin Roden.
23 Q. And where are you from, Dr. Roden?
24 A. I'm from Midland, Texas.
25 Q. Can you tell us a little bit about your

1 background please.

2 **A. Yes. I graduated from University of Texas in**
3 **Austin with a degree in exercise physiology. I then**
4 **graduated from University of Texas Permian Basin with a**
5 **master's in genetics.**

6 **I went to medical school at University of**
7 **Texas Medical Branch in Galveston where I got my**
8 **doctorate. I got a Scott and White residency and**
9 **internship in emergency medicine in Temple, Texas.**

10 **I then was in private practice in Midland**
11 **at Midland Memorial Hospital for approximately three to**
12 **four years, at which time I left, was accepted to the**
13 **space program as a flight surgeon.**

14 **I did a master's of public health at**
15 **University of Texas Medical Branch and an aerospace**
16 **fellowship with NASA and University of Texas Medical**
17 **Branch. I then was a NASA flight surgeon for**
18 **eight years.**

19 **I have recently left the government, in**
20 **private practice with a group out of Austin practicing**
21 **in College Station in Bryan, Texas, with St. Joseph's**
22 **Hospital in emergency services partnership.**

23 **I'm a board certified emergency physician**
24 **and a fellow of the American College of Emergency**
25 **Physicians.**

1 **Q. So I guess when someone says you're no rocket**
2 **scientist, you actually are?**

3 **A. Absolutely.**

4 **Q. Can you tell me please did you have the**
5 **opportunity to review five separate charts on five**
6 **different individuals that were treated at the Winkler**
7 **County Memorial Hospital by Dr. Arafiles?**

8 **A. Yes, I was asked to review five charts on five**
9 **different patients.**

10 **Q. And did you do that?**

11 **A. Yes, I did.**

12 **Q. And did you examine them with an eye towards**
13 **their care?**

14 **A. Yes, I did.**

15 **Q. And can you tell us whether or not you formed**
16 **an opinion as to whether or not the care given to each**
17 **one of those individuals met the minimum standards of**
18 **care?**

19 **A. Yes. In reviewing the five cases, I had some**
20 **concerns that the standard of care was not met.**

21 **Q. So is it your opinion that the standard of care**
22 **in all five of those cases was substandard?**

23 **A. Yes, that is correct.**

24 **Q. And not only was the medical care substandard,**
25 **did they rise to the level that there was patient**

1 safety -- excuse me, patient care concerns of all five
2 of those patients?

3 **A. In all five cases, after reviewing what was**
4 **found in the documents, I would find that there would be**
5 **some concerns that at least it would need to be reviewed**
6 **or would bring some questions into the standard of care.**

7 **Q. Thank you, Dr. Roden.**

8 **MR. CARNEY: I'll pass the witness.**

9
10 **CROSS-EXAMINATION**

11 **BY MR. TIDWELL:**

12 **Q. Good morning, Sean.**

13 **A. Good morning.**

14 **Q. It's been a long time.**

15 **A. Yes, it has. Good to see you.**

16 **Q. You and I have known each other for a long,**
17 **long time, haven't we?**

18 **A. Absolutely, yes, sir.**

19 **Q. Okay. You've been a governmental employee?**

20 **A. Yes, sir.**

21 **Q. And you understand that governmental employees**
22 **are public servants?**

23 **A. Absolutely, yes, sir.**

24 **Q. And as a public servant, should you allow a**
25 **decision as a public servant to be based on any personal**

1 **animosity or personal vendetta?**

2 **A. No.**

3 **Q. And if a governmental employee were to make a**
4 **decision based on personal vendetta, are they acting as**
5 **a governmental employee anymore?**

6 **A. No, they are not.**

7 **Q. Okay. Thank you very much, Dr. Roden. It's**
8 **good to see you.**

9 **A. Good to see you.**

10 **THE COURT: Mr. Carney?**

11 **MR. CARNEY: Nothing further, Your Honor.**

12 **THE COURT: You can step down. Thank you.**

13 **THE WITNESS: Sure.**

14 **THE COURT: May this witness be excused?**

15 **MR. TIDWELL: Yes, Your Honor.**

16 **THE COURT: Okay. You're free to go.**

17 **Call your next witness please.**

18 **MR. COOK: Your Honor, ladies and**
19 **gentlemen of the jury, the defense rests.**

20 **(DEFENDANT RESTS)**

21 **THE COURT: Rebuttal, Mr. Tidwell?**

22 **MR. TIDWELL: The State has no rebuttal,**
23 **Your Honor.**

24 **THE COURT: Close?**

25 **MR. TIDWELL: Close.**

1 THE COURT: Close?
 2 MR. COOK: Your Honor, the defense would
 3 close.

4 (EVIDENCE CLOSED)

09:07AM 5 THE COURT: Both sides have closed. That
 6 means you've heard all the evidence that you will hear
 7 in deciding the case.

8 Would the attorneys approach please.

9 (AT BENCH, OFF THE RECORD)

09:09AM 10 THE COURT: We have a few legal matters
 11 that we need to take care of. We worked on that some
 12 last night. But frankly the court was a little bit
 13 surprised by everybody closing right now. So I'm --
 14 we're going to be in recess for one hour so we can get
 09:09AM 15 those things taken care of.

16 You're free to go and do whatever you want
 17 to do. If you want to stay there, I'll have somebody go
 18 get you some doughnuts and if you just want to stay in
 19 the jury room and enjoy the warmth. But you're free to
 09:09AM 20 go, move outside the jury room. Keep in mind the
 21 instructions I gave you earlier.

22 And if you'll just -- well, let's just --
 23 I'll just say 10:00, instead of an hour, if you'll just
 24 be back in the jury room at 10:00, we'll bring you in.

09:09AM 25 What will happen then, I'll read to you

1 the charge of the court, which are instructions and the
 2 law that you'll follow in deciding the case, and the
 3 lawyers will make brief arguments, and then you'll
 4 retire to consider your verdict.

09:10AM 5 So we'll be in recess until 10:00.

6 (JURY NOT PRESENT)

7 (A recess was taken from 9:10 to 10:18.)

8 THE COURT: After the close of the
 9 evidence both sides have received a copy of the proposed
 10 charge of the court. Is there any objection from the
 11 State?

12 MR. TIDWELL: None from the State, Your
 13 Honor.

14 THE COURT: Objections or suggested
 10:18AM 15 charges from the defense?

16 MR. CARNEY: Yes, Your Honor.

17 THE COURT: Go ahead.

18 MR. CARNEY: With regard to the charge
 19 that we've just been delivered, I'd like -- in the back
 10:18AM 20 on the -- one of the verdict forms, we would object that
 21 the -- it says we, the jury, find the Defendant, Anne
 22 Marie Mitchell, guilty. I think that it would be better
 23 to put we find beyond a reasonable doubt the Defendant,
 24 Anne Marie Mitchell, guilty. That's the only change we
 10:18AM 25 really haven't discussed, but I'll put my objections in

1 now --

2 THE COURT: Okay.

3 MR. CARNEY: -- for that --

4 THE COURT: All right.

10:19AM 5 MR. CARNEY: -- if that's okay.

6 THE COURT: Yeah, go ahead.

7 MR. CARNEY: With regard to the charge,
 8 Your Honor, I think that there are several things.

9 We've filed this morning a special requested charge on
 10:19AM 10 guilt and innocence, number one, regarding a 3823 charge
 11 that we're asking to be added to the charge, Your Honor,
 12 regarding an illegal search and seizure conducted with
 13 regard to confidential information and the use of that
 14 as being illegal by a peace officer in the State of
 10:19AM 15 Texas.

16 THE COURT: And that's been filed,
 17 correct?

18 MR. CARNEY: Yes, sir, it has been.

19 THE COURT: All right. Go ahead.

10:19AM 20 MR. CARNEY: In addition to that, Your
 21 Honor, I know that we've presented to the court our --
 22 we presented the court a draft of the charge regarding
 23 multiple issues that we asked to be included in the
 24 charge. Among those included in that is a requested
 10:19AM 25 charge on the suppression issue on the 3823.

1 In addition to that there are multiple
 2 issues with regard to definitions within the Occupation
 3 Code, from the Medical Practice Act, the Nurse Practice
 4 Act, and the Occupation Code with regard to someone not
 10:20AM 5 being able to be suspended, terminated, or otherwise
 6 disciplined for reporting -- a report made to the
 7 medical board; in addition that -- a charge regarding
 8 that each complaint is privileged and confidential.

9 We've also requested a charge, an
 10:20AM 10 instruction, regarding that what a medical licensee is
 11 with regard to that so that it's clear that a licensee
 12 is a doctor and not a nurse, under the statute, Your
 13 Honor, just so that that would clear up the issue with
 14 regard to the search and seizure conducted by Sheriff
 10:20AM 15 Roberts and that which led him to Ms. Mitchell and
 16 Ms. Galle.

17 Also, Your Honor, I believe that with
 18 regard to our requested charge on guilt and innocence, I
 19 would refer the court to Madden versus State, 242 S.W.3d
 10:21AM 20 504, the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals, a 2007 case,
 21 that talks about a disputed issue of fact, and that if
 22 there is a disputed issue of fact with regard to a
 23 search and seizure that that issue goes to the jury as
 24 opposed to a question of law that is solely for the
 10:21AM 25 court.

1 For example, I think that the issues that
2 exist in the record that raise that issue are that the
3 sheriff stated that he was investigating a licensee and
4 he made that representation to the Texas Medical Board,
5 which allowed him to receive a copy of the complaint
6 that he was not allowed to have and that was
7 confidential and privileged.

8 I think it also goes to whether or not
9 there was a reasonable suspicion whether or not an
10 offense was reported. And I believe there is no
11 articulable facts to show that an offense was reported
12 at the time that Dr. Arafles came to Sheriff Roberts.
13 And no facts that stated an offense are in the record
14 regarding that, Your Honor.

15 I think those issues are disputed, I think
16 they're fact issues, and I think they warrant the
17 inclusion of that.

18 I would offer as an Exhibit 8 to the
19 record a full copy of the charge that we propose to the
20 court, Your Honor, along with the verdict forms, so that
21 it's made and incorporated as a part of our objections.

22 (Defendant's Exhibit No. 8 offered)

23 THE COURT: Okay. They're admitted for
24 purposes of the record.

25 (Defendant's Exhibit No. 8 received)

1 MR. CARNEY: Thank you.

2 THE COURT: The -- anything else?

3 MR. CARNEY: No, Your Honor.

4 THE COURT: The objections to the charge
5 are overruled. And the charges -- the proposed charges,
6 other than those that we've already included in the
7 court's charge, are denied.

8 MR. CARNEY: And the verdict form, Your
9 Honor, is that --

10 THE COURT: That's overruled, also.

11 MR. CARNEY: Okay.

12 THE COURT: Anything else?

13 MR. TIDWELL: Nothing from the State, Your
14 Honor.

15 THE COURT: You want to argue how long,
16 did we talk about?

17 MR. COOK: Judge, I thought we agreed we'd
18 take 30 minutes or so.

19 THE COURT: Okay. Any objection to that?

20 MR. TIDWELL: No, sir.

21 MR. COOK: And, judge, for the court's --
22 just to let the court, that Mr. Carney and I plan to
23 split our time.

24 THE COURT: Okay.

25 MR. COOK: And we can handle the time and

1 how much each of us are using.

2 THE COURT: Okay. I generally give you a
3 two-minute warning when all of your time is used up.
4 Other than that you're on your own.

5 MR. COOK: Thank you, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Bring in the jury.

7 (JURY PRESENT)

8 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, I will
9 now read to you the charge of the court, which are the
10 instructions and the law that you will use in deciding
11 the case. The lawyers will then give arguments, and
12 then you'll retire to consider your verdict.

13 (COURT'S CHARGE READ TO THE JURY)

14 THE COURT: Ready to proceed with
15 argument?

16 MR. TIDWELL: Ready, Your Honor.

17 THE COURT: Go ahead.

18 MR. TIDWELL: Thank you, Your Honor. May
19 it please the court, counsel.

20 Good morning again, ladies and gentlemen.

21 I told you thank you when we started this,
22 and I want to start by saying thank you again.

23 Obviously there was a dispute in issue in this case that
24 we needed your help resolving. I very much appreciate

25 your time and the energy you are about to expend in

1 helping us do this. The other lawyers do, too. We
2 can't do our system of justice without you.

3 I want to remind you that the State of
4 Texas has the burden of proof in the case, and the
5 burden of proof is beyond a reasonable doubt. In a few
6 moments I'm going to ask you to go into the jury room
7 and return a verdict of guilty.

8 Thank you very much.

9 Reserve my time, Your Honor.

10 MR. CARNEY: Good morning. As you can
11 tell the cold air is really doing wonders for me.

12 I know y'all haven't heard from me, at
13 least on the record. You probably heard me over there
14 telling Mr. Cook things that because of the acoustics in
15 this room I'm always constantly I think in the course of
16 this thing ask this, what about that, which I think not
17 only probably annoyed you but it wasn't doing much for
18 Mr. Cook either. At least this way I'm up in front of
19 you talking.

20 And this won't take very long, but I want
21 to go through a few things with you while we have some
22 time.

23 For starters, the court's charge is -- I
24 have little children that Mr. Cook kind of alluded to in
25 voir dire, and so these things remind me of the

1 instructions Christmas night you get them and they tell
2 you no assembly, you know, required, and about 4:00 a.m.
3 on Christmas morning you're putting the last piece
4 together of some toy and you have pieces left over and
10:33AM 5 you wonder what you've missed.

6 These are like those instructions.
7 They're not exactly straightforward. They're not
8 necessarily complicated either, but I want to go through
9 them a little bit just to kind of explain some points
10:34AM 10 that I think are important, okay?

11 With regard to the allegations in this
12 case, the government has to prove every allegation they
13 allege. They have to prove that someone was a public
14 servant. We know that's true. But they also have to
10:34AM 15 prove that the information that was transmitted was sent
16 for a nongovernmental purpose.

17 And in the charge, it states that the
18 Texas Medical Board is an agency of the executive branch
19 of the State government with the power to regulate the
10:34AM 20 practice of medicine; a governmental agency, as we all
21 heard from a lot of different witnesses, okay?

22 Also, a couple of other things, with
23 regard to proving each and every element, I think that
24 the element about how it was used for nongovernmental
10:34AM 25 purpose is a real issue that I think has to be resolved,

1 and I think that's -- that has been shown to you that it
2 hasn't been proved.

3 Every person who testified talked about,
4 from Mr. Swanson, who was the first witness, all the way
10:35AM 5 through the very end of the State's case, everyone said
6 that Anne Mitchell was concerned about patient safety,
7 everyone.

8 Even the people who didn't have nice
9 things to say about her, about her personality or about
10:35AM 10 commentary she had about the poor practice that
11 Dr. Arafles provided some of these patients, they all
12 agreed, well, Anne is concerned about patient safety.
13 This is not something that she just fabricated up.

14 And not only did you hear from nurses who
10:35AM 15 treated people with Dr. Arafles, you heard from a board
16 certified physician saying I looked at it and that ain't
17 going to work.

18 All those justify a need to report to the
19 governmental agency and for that purpose.

10:35AM 20 Now I wanted to explain to you kind of the
21 logistics here. We get to get up and discuss with you
22 the close. And because the State has the burden they
23 get to go first and they get to go last. So there's a
24 little jockeying for position.

10:35AM 25 I mean, you think Mr. Tidwell would get up

1 and say more to you with regard to his argument on the
2 first part. And that's a strategic move. I mean, he
3 gets to close first, he gets to have the last word. He
4 gets to tell you about what his case is about. So
10:36AM 5 that's --

6 But it's not uncommon with the rest of
7 this case. There has been a lot of jockeying for
8 position. You heard from the sheriff. He said I got
9 these letters, I got one from Naomi Warren, I have the
10:36AM 10 one from Anne Mitchell, I don't know if Naomi Warren
11 really wrote that letter, I'm not really --

12 And since I have little kids, and I have a
13 three-year-old as well as a seven-year-old, we have a
14 lot of jockeying for position in our house, you know,
10:36AM 15 there is a lot of questions that did you eat the
16 chocolate chip cookie, I didn't eat the chocolate chip
17 cookie, well, did you eat the strawberry cookie, yeah,
18 yeah, I did.

19 I mean, there's -- you know, it's all
10:36AM 20 shaded, it's all shaded to kind of -- well, maybe. You
21 know, did y'all go out and drink beer last night? No,
22 we didn't drink beer. Well, you know, it's all these --

23 And that's what this case has come down
24 to. It's, well, we looked at her and that's -- we think
10:37AM 25 that's the problem, but now that other deal, we weren't

1 sure that was really Naomi Warren, that's not -- that's
2 somebody we really kind of like, that's someone we
3 have -- doesn't give us any problems at the hospital, so
4 let's just don't -- let's kind of put some blinders on
10:37AM 5 that and go on.

6 The thing that's interesting is within the
7 Texas Medical Board, their mission as they state it is
8 our mission is to protect and enhance the public's
9 health, safety, and welfare by establishing and
10:37AM 10 maintaining standards of excellence used in regulating
11 the practice of medicine and insuring quality healthcare
12 for citizens of Texas through licensure, excuse me,
13 discipline, and education.

14 And these complaints that are brought to
10:37AM 15 the medical board are confidential and privileged. No
16 one could have known about those things.

17 No one would have ever known this took
18 place except Dr. Arafles had to go down because he was
19 afraid something bad was going to happen to him because
10:37AM 20 of his previous experience, he had to go down and tell
21 the sheriff you've got to stop this deal, this is
22 harassment, this is causing me some angst, I -- you've
23 got to put the quietus on this thing, go over there and
24 shut that deal down.

10:38AM 25 That's exactly what happened. And it kept

1 rolling and rolling, and here we are.

2 You know, I think y'all have heard plenty
3 about this case. I don't think you need to hear me talk
4 a whole lot about it to interpret it.

10:38AM 5 Mr. Tidwell said in his voir dire about
6 reasonable doubt and proof beyond a reasonable doubt and
7 we've all talked about the standards.

8 He said an interesting thing. He said,
9 well, you need to just vote your conscience. That's not
10 proof beyond a reasonable doubt, but I think it surely
11 figures into your common sense in coming in here and
12 listening to this evidence and figuring out what your
13 conscience tells you about what really was going on here
14 and whether or not this is really a felony.

10:38AM 15 Now Mr. Cook is finishing up on our part
16 of the argument, but I would implore you that before you
17 let Mr. Tidwell sit down make him, make him show you on
18 that chart he had over here that he used on opening
19 statement, how this was for a nongovernmental purpose,
10:39AM 20 how the Texas Medical Board is not a governmental
21 purpose, how this was sent for a -- to a nongovernmental
22 agency.

23 You know, this wasn't sent to -- this
24 wasn't sent out to the Boy Scouts, you know, in a
10:39AM 25 meeting. This wasn't discussed at the Lions Club with a

1 bunch of people at lunch said hey, you know who came by
2 the hospital, blah, blah, blah, I saw their chart, you
3 know what they have.

4 This was sent to the Texas Medical Board,
10:39AM 5 an exempt agency within the government, no
6 nongovernmental purpose to it.

7 They've got to prove all the elements.
8 And before he sits down make him tell you that, make him
9 show you how he figures out the Texas Medical Board is a
10:39AM 10 nongovernmental agency. We haven't heard about it. It
11 would be interesting to hear the take on it.

12 That element is completely lacking, along
13 with the other ones that you heard, but that one is
14 lacking. So please consider that when you're
10:39AM 15 considering what is beyond a reasonable doubt and what
16 your conscience tells you about what is really going on
17 here.

18 Thank you for your time. I appreciate it.
19 THE COURT: Mr. Cook.

10:40AM 20 MR. COOK: Thank you, Your Honor.
21 Ladies and gentlemen, on voir dire I told
22 you there are certain things that we do not trust to the
23 government. Chief among that is our liberty. I think
24 this case shows you why.

10:40AM 25 And I'm not worried about what you're

1 going to do back there. I know you're going to do the
2 right thing because Texans have always stood for
3 liberty.

4 The State said that they were going to
10:40AM 5 show a pattern of harassment that would prove a public
6 official abused the public trust, that was being driven
7 by a personal vendetta, and that there was breaches of
8 confidentiality by this public servant. And I will tell
9 you right now I believe they have proved that beyond any
10:41AM 10 doubt. But the victim in this case is not Dr. Arafiles.

11 The victim in this case is Ms. Anne Mitchell.

12 We talked about duties. What is duty?
13 Doing your duty is doing your job. Doing your duty is
14 doing what is right.

10:41AM 15 What's the duty of a nurse? To care for
16 us, to assist doctors and others in that care. But the
17 most sacred duty, their highest calling, is to protect
18 us.

19 Anne Mitchell does her duty.

10:42AM 20 What's the duty of a public servant? To
21 use the power that they're entrusted with for the public
22 good, not to use that power maliciously for their own
23 personal agendas, not to deny citizens their liberty, to
24 deny them their rights, to deny them their ability to
10:42AM 25 earn a living.

1 And remember, those are things that were
2 not given to us by government. They were not given to
3 us by kings or presidents or sheriffs. They were given
4 to us by the Almighty. They are sacred.

10:43AM 5 Let's talk about honor. I told you I grew
6 up in a military family. I told you that I myself
7 joined the military right out of high school. I grew up
8 with a sense of honor, and I hope that I do.

9 What is honor? Honor is being honest.
10:43AM 10 Honor is serving selflessly. Honor is admitting your
11 mistakes.

12 A doctor who will not admit his mistakes
13 has no honor. A doctor who blames everybody for the
14 harm and the pain that he causes and will not learn from
10:43AM 15 his mistakes is dangerous.

16 Let's talk about courage. Courage is
17 sacrificing yourself to protect others. Anne Mitchell
18 is a woman of courage. Anne Mitchell has made
19 sacrifices.

10:44AM 20 What is her motive in this? She got tired
21 of seeing people getting hurt. She tried to work within
22 the system, but it got to a point where the system
23 failed the patients. She did what she had to do,
24 knowing that she would be retaliated against because
10:44AM 25 this man was a friend of powers that be in that town.

1 Anne Mitchell is a professional. She did
2 her duty. She did it with courage. She did it with
3 honor.

4 And I'll tell you something else about
10:45AM 5 Anne Mitchell. She has courage to stand up against
6 injustice. She has courage to stand up not only for
7 herself and her family, but for the rights of every
8 nurse to do their duty to protect us.

9 Shame on them for abusing their public
10:45AM 10 trust. Shame on them for using the powers entrusted to
11 them by us for their own personal gains and wishes.
12 Shame on them for seeking to destroy professionals who
13 for more than 20 years gave them their labors, their
14 hearts, and their soul.

10:45AM 15 Shame on them for not having the honor to
16 admit their mistakes. Shame on them for not saying I'm
17 sorry. Shame on them for putting fear in every nurse in
18 doing their duty. Shame on them for subjecting all
19 Texans to ridicule by their Boss Hogg mentality.

10:46AM 20 Texans have always stood for liberty.
21 It's in our souls. You can't undo all the pain, all the
22 suffering, and all the hardship that Anne and her family
23 has been made to suffer. But today you can restore her
24 liberty. I know you will do that.

10:46AM 25 Stand now for liberty by returning the

1 only verdict that is proper in this case under the law
2 and the evidence. Go back there, sign the verdict form
3 that says we, the jury, find Anne Mitchell not guilty.

4 Thank you.

10:47AM 5 THE COURT: Mr. Tidwell.

6 MR. TIDWELL: Thank you, judge.

7 I'm holding one piece of paper, I don't
8 have anything else on the desk, holding one piece of
9 paper. This is the charge of the court. This is all we
10:47AM 10 need. This is the law of this case. This is what you
11 need to do. This is the only thing that's important.

12 We lawyers use a term smoke and mirrors.
13 The only things that are important in this case are in
14 this document. Look at this document when you get back
10:48AM 15 there.

16 You will not find that the Texas Medical
17 Board is on trial. You will not find a single question
18 in here to answer what did the Texas Medical Board do or
19 should not do. We are not here to do their job. The
10:48AM 20 Texas Medical Board will do their job in due course.
21 That is their function.

22 The other person that's not on trial in
23 this is Dr. Arafles. You will not see a question did
24 he do the right care, did he not do the right care. It
10:48AM 25 doesn't matter in this charge. That is an issue for the

1 Texas Medical Board. They will deal with that. You
2 heard Ms. Lockhart, Dr. Lockhart, the expert, say the
3 Texas Medical Board will do their job.

4 I hope they do. I want them to do their
10:49AM 5 job. We need them to do their job. But we're not here
6 to do their job for them.

7 This document is important because it's
8 the charge of the court. It's all that's important.

9 Thinking about should Dr. Arafles done
10:49AM 10 this or should not have done it or what was the standard
11 of care, that's all smoke and mirrors. Defense counsel
12 wants you to get honed in on that because they don't
13 want you to consider what's actually the issue in this
14 case.

10:49AM 15 This case is a very simple case. We're
16 four days into it, but this is a very simple case, I'll
17 show you in a minute why.

18 On page 4 of this charge, the judge will
19 instruct you the law is do not let bias, sympathy,
10:50AM 20 prejudice, or any other emotion play any part in your
21 deliberation. Don't do that. The judge tells you not
22 to do that.

23 There is a book that was on Oprah's book
24 club called A Lesson Before Dying. I keep -- it's a
10:50AM 25 little paperback book; it's pretty thin. It's a good

1 little read. I buy 10 of them at a time. And anybody
2 that I know that goes to law school I give them a copy
3 of that book. And I write in the front of that book,
4 because it's what the book is about, lawyers, all we
10:50AM 5 have is words. That's all we have.

6 We have to be careful that our words don't
7 hurt people. We have to be careful with the things we
8 say. We have to be careful that we don't accuse every
9 employee in the Winkler County hospital of being
10:51AM 10 incompetent. We're not supposed to do that. Those
11 words are harmful to those good, kind people that work
12 in my hospital in my county. Those words hurt them.

13 I live in a small town; so do you. You
14 depend on your hospital for your healthcare. You depend
10:51AM 15 on the very fine professionals in that facility to take
16 care of you. We all do. We don't live in Dallas or
17 Houston where there's huge medical centers. We have to
18 be able to depend on the people that are in our
19 hospital.

10:51AM 20 What was the last evidence you heard in
21 this trial? Mr. Cook asked Dr. Roden, Sean, are you a
22 rocket scientist. And you giggled, and so did I, and so
23 did Sean. I mean, he sort of is. What's the last thing
24 you heard him say? A governmental employee should not
10:52AM 25 let their personal feelings or vendettas drive a

1 decision. That's the last evidence you heard out of the
2 witness chair. Dr. Roden is exactly right. A public
3 servant cannot do that, cannot do that.

4 Mr. Carney wants you to focus on the only
10:52AM 5 thing for -- in the governmental purpose is the Texas
6 Medical Board governmental. Certainly they are. But
7 this charge doesn't ask you that.

8 This charge asks you did she, the
9 Defendant, disclose or use information for a
10:52AM 10 nongovernmental purpose. It's not about the Texas
11 Medical Board. It's about the Defendant. What was her
12 purpose?

13 Well, we know what her purpose was. We've
14 heard from the other nurses at the facility. It was a
10:53AM 15 personal vendetta. It started from day one. She didn't
16 get her way and block Dr. Arafles from being hired.
17 And Mr. Wiley told you from day one she didn't like him
18 and it got worse day by day by day.

19 You heard the fine Dr. Lockhart tell you a
10:53AM 20 nurse should not say, it is not appropriate, to say the
21 doctor is an S.O.B., and that indicates personal
22 animosity. Dr. Lockhart told you that. And
23 Dr. Lockhart told you that is not appropriate for a
24 nurse. Nurses should be held to a higher standard than
10:53AM 25 that. They're supposed to remove themselves from that

1 sort of thing. I agree, they should. She didn't. This
2 was a personal vendetta starting on day one.

3 I told you when we started that there was
4 a number that was going to be important, and there is.

10:54AM 5 Let me tell you the first number,
6 99.99999. That's the percentage of nurses in our
7 country who are fine, decent, hard-, hardworking people
8 that do a wonderful job when we need them and when we're
9 sick. There are hundreds of thousands of healthcare
10:54AM 10 professionals out there doing their job every day. But
11 that's not the important number.

12 The important number is the .0000001. The
13 important number in this case is one, because that's all
14 we're here about, what did this one person do to drive
10:54AM 15 her personal vendetta. It's not about the big number.
16 It's about the one. Those hundreds of thousands of
17 nurses do a great job every day. But in every
18 profession sometimes there's problems with one, in mine,
19 in yours, in all of ours. This is about one.

10:55AM 20 What about the patients? Do you think
21 they ever imagined their personal information that they
22 think they got good medical care based on would be
23 disseminated out on the Internet? And it is because of
24 one, it is because of one.

10:55AM 25 MR. CARNEY: Objection, Your Honor.

1 That's not in the evidence, and that's not what the
2 charge against Ms. Mitchell is.

3 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, the
4 lawyers are allowed to argue what they believe the
10:55AM 5 evidence shows and reasonable deductions therefrom.

6 You are instructed in the charge that you
7 are the sole judges of the evidence, of the credibility
8 of the witnesses, and the weight to be given their
9 testimony.

10:56AM 10 Again, the lawyers are allowed to make
11 their arguments, but you judge the case based on your
12 judgment and the evidence that you heard from the
13 witness stand.

14 Go ahead.

10:56AM 15 MR. TIDWELL: Thank you, judge.

16 What did you hear Judge Leck, our county
17 judge from Kermit, tell you? Known Ms. Mitchell a long
18 time, she's a good nurse, she does a good job.
19 Certainly she has done a fine, fine job for many, many,
10:56AM 20 many years.

21 What did Judge Leck tell you? Should a
22 public servant allow personal animosity or vendetta in
23 any decision they make? What did Judge Leck say? No,
24 that is not what we're supposed to do. Every witness
10:56AM 25 told you that.

1 What did Mr. Wiley, the administrator,
2 tell you? We are public employees. We hold ourselves
3 to a higher standard.

4 What else did he tell you? He'd had
10:56AM 5 trouble with Ms. Mitchell from the beginning. She was,
6 when he took over as the administrator, untouchable
7 because of her relationship with Judge Leck. He'd gone
8 to Judge Leck many times to try to get something
9 changed. And he couldn't stop Ms. Mitchell's vendetta.

10:57AM 10 The elements of the case are what we're
11 here about. The judge tells you that intent is one of
12 the important things. It's right at the bottom. I
13 underlined it several times.

14 The judge also tells you on page 2 you're
10:57AM 15 instructed as a part of the law in this case that intent
16 may be inferred from acts done, if any, or words spoken.
17 That's the problem, this personal vendetta was about
18 words.

19 Mr. Carney wants me to prove the elements
10:57AM 20 of the case. I want to prove the elements of the case.
21 That's all this case is about. This is a simple case.
22 I told you in the beginning I had to prove
23 Anne Mitchell was a public servant. Mr. Carney agrees
24 she is.

10:58AM 25 I told you I had to, let's skip down,

1 prove that she had access to the confidential
2 information because of her office. They agree she did.
3 That the information had not been made
4 public. They agree that it had not.

10:58AM 5 The rub was going to come, I told you in
6 the beginning, with the intent to harm another,
7 Dr. Arafles. And the judge tells you in here harm
8 means anything reasonably regarded as loss,
9 disadvantage, or injury. That's in your charge; you'll
10 see that. Okay?

11 And that it was the disclosure of
12 information for a nongovernmental purpose; not what is
13 the purpose of the Texas Medical Board, not what is all
14 those other purposes. It's the purpose --

10:58AM 15 nongovernmental purpose of this Defendant, one. One,
16 that's the important number.

17 What should nurses do? Nurses have
18 duties, thank goodness. Nurses from day to day report
19 things that they ought to report. I appreciate that.

10:59AM 20 Most nurses do it excellently.

21 This nurse was a public servant. She had
22 a higher duty. She had all --

23 MR. CARNEY: Objection, Your Honor.
24 That's not the evidence nor is it the law, Your Honor.

10:59AM 25 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, you will

1 be guided by the evidence that you heard, not what the
2 lawyers say. The law is contained in the charge of the
3 court, and you are to be guided thereby, not by what the
4 lawyers say.

10:59AM 5 Go ahead.

6 MR. TIDWELL: Thank you.

7 What should a public servant do?
8 Mr. Wiley told you. Ms. Lockhart told -- Dr. Lockhart
9 told you. Dr. Roden told you. Hold yourself to a
10 different standard. Do not let personal animosity,
11 feelings, or vendettas guide your decisions. You heard
12 that from every witness. No one told you anything
13 differently.

14 I told you in the beginning that I wanted
15 you to come and vote your conscience. That's exactly
16 what I want you to do, your conscience. You arrive at
17 your verdict. Whether it's guilty or not guilty, you
18 arrive at your verdict and you vote your conscience in
19 this case.

11:00AM 20 This case is very simple. This case is
21 about one thing. It's about a public servant that let
22 personal animosity drive her decision. That's all it's
23 about, very simple.

11:00AM 24 Thank you again for helping us with this
25 dispute. We all have a part of this process. I'm going

1 to turn it over to you because I think you will do the
2 right thing.

3 And I think the evidence beyond a
4 reasonable doubt shows that this lady let these personal
11:01AM 5 things creep in and shouldn't have. And I'll ask you
6 now to go back and return a verdict of guilty.

7 Thank you again very, very much for your
8 time.

9 THE COURT: The jury will now retire to
11:01AM 10 consider your verdict.

11 (The jury retired to the jury room
12 to begin their deliberations at
13 11:01 a.m.)

14 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, the jury
12:00PM 15 has indicated they have reached a verdict and will
16 announce that verdict. And I remind you that no
17 demonstration of approval, disapproval, or whatever is
18 acceptable. This is a court of law, and we expect
19 everyone to conduct themselves with dignity. So please
20 help me with that and we'll be just fine.

12:01PM 21 Bring in the jury.

22 (JURY PRESENT)

23 THE COURT: Mr. Tyler, you're the
24 presiding juror; is that correct?

12:01PM 25 THE FOREPERSON: Yes, Your Honor.

1 THE COURT: And you've reached a verdict?

2 THE FOREPERSON: Yes, Your Honor.

3 THE COURT: Would you hand it to the
4 bailiff please.

12:01PM 5 The verdict reads as follows: We, the
6 jury, find the Defendant, Anne Marie Mitchell, not
7 guilty, signed by Mr. Tyler as presiding juror.

8 Either side wish to have the jury polled?

9 MR. TIDWELL: The State does not, Your
12:02PM 10 Honor.

11 MR. COOK: No, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, I have
13 previously instructed you that you can't talk to anybody
14 about this case. You can now talk to anybody you want
12:02PM 15 to about the case or you can refuse to do so. And if
16 you refuse and somebody pesters you, let me know and
17 I'll take care of that for you. But you're free to talk
18 to anybody you want to.

19 A couple other things. I can't express
12:02PM 20 enough appreciation for your service this week. We
21 really appreciate it.

22 Sometimes jurors worry about your -- their
23 verdicts, did we do the right thing, and you shouldn't
24 do that. And in saying that I don't mean to express any
12:02PM 25 approval, disapproval, of your verdict, I don't care

1 what you decide. But you shouldn't worry about that.

2 The way the system works is we present the
3 law to you, the attorneys present the facts to you, and
4 you decide. And whatever decision you come to is the
5 correct decision.

6 And sometimes folks criticize juries and
7 they'll -- you'll hear people on TV or in the public at
8 the coffee shop or wherever saying I can't believe this
9 jury did that or that jury did something else. And

10 usually those statements are made by people that haven't
11 been back in a jury room doing what you guys have done
12 this week.

13 So maybe when you hear those things in the
14 future you'll let those folks know that things are a
15 little bit different when you're in the trenches.

16 I'm going to let you go at this time. I'm
17 going to ask the folks here and in the hallway to let
18 you go home and leave in peace if you want to leave in
19 peace. If you want to stay around and talk to the
20 lawyers, that's okay. Sometimes they like to know what
21 you think. But I'm going to make sure you can leave in
22 peace if that's what you want to do.

23 You're free to go. I thank you very much
24 for your service.

25 (JURY NOT PRESENT)

1 MR. COOK: I take it the court has
2 accepted the verdict --

3 THE COURT: The verdict is accepted and
4 you're free to go, Ms. Mitchell.

5 THE DEFENDANT: Thank you.

6 MR. COOK: Thank you, Your Honor.

7 (COURT ADJOURNED)

1 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

2 THE STATE OF TEXAS)

3

4 COUNTY OF ANDREWS)

5

6 I, Kelly Allen, Official Court Reporter in
7 and for the 109th District Court of Andrews County,
8 State of Texas, do hereby certify that the above and
9 foregoing contains a true and correct transcription of
10 all portions of evidence and other proceedings requested
11 in writing by counsel for the parties to be included in
12 this volume of the Reporter's Record in the above-styled
13 and numbered cause, all of which occurred in open court
14 or in chambers and were reported by me.

15 I further certify that this Reporter's
16 Record of the proceedings truly and correctly reflects
17 the exhibits, if any, offered by the respective parties.

18 I further certify that the total cost for
19 the preparation of this Reporter's Record is \$
20 and will be paid by Mr. Brian Carney, Attorney for
21 Defendant.

22 WITNESS MY OFFICIAL HAND this the ____ day
23 of _____, 2010.

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

Kelly Allen, CSR
Official Court Reporter
109th District Court
Andrews County, Texas
Andrews County Courthouse, Room 201
Andrews, Texas 79714
Phone: (432) 524-1480
CSR No. 1618
Expiration: 12/31/10